

**A REGULAR MEETING OF THE BERKLEY CITY PLANNING COMMISSION WAS CALLED TO ORDER AT 7:30 PM, DECEMBER 12, 2017 AT CITY HALL BY CHAIRPERSON BUCKLER.**

---

*The minutes from this meeting are in summary form capturing the actions taken on each agenda item. To view the meeting discussions in their entirety, this meeting is broadcasted on the city's government access channel, WBRK, every day at 9AM and 9PM. The video can also be seen, on-demand, on the city's YouTube channel: <https://www.youtube.com/user/cityofberkeley>.*

**PRESENT:**            Martin Smith                            Mark Richardson                    Dean Smith  
                          Tim Murad                                Michele Buckler                    Ann Shadle  
                          Kristen Kapelanski                    Joe Tangari

**ABSENT:**            David Barnett

**ALSO PRESENT:** Matthew Baumgarten, City Manager (Recording Secretary)

\* \* \* \* \*

**APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

It was recommended by Commissioner Murad that the second agenda item be relabeled as a "Discussion" in order to avoid any confusion with a "public hearing."

It was moved by Commissioner Murad to approve the agenda as amended and supported by Commissioner Shadle.

AYES:            Richardson, Murad, D. Smith, M. Smith, Shadle, Kapelanski, Tangari, and Buckler  
NAYS:            None  
Motion Carried.

\* \* \* \* \*

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

Commissioners proposed corrections to the draft minutes.

It was moved by Commissioner Tangari to approve the minutes of October 24, 2017 with corrections and supported by Commissioner Kapelanski.

AYES:            Richardson, Murad, D. Smith, M. Smith, Shadle, Kapelanski, Tangari, and Buckler  
NAYS:            None  
Motion Carried.

\* \* \* \* \*

**COMMUNICATIONS**

Chairperson Buckler noted items for communication included in the packet.

\* \* \* \* \*

**CITIZEN COMMENTS**

Chuck Tyrell indicated he recently had a FOIA request for written procedures for ensuring Planning Commission conditions denied because those procedures were not in written form. Mr. Tyrell told the Planning Commission that they are not allowed to use conditions anymore.

\*\*\*\*\*

1. **SITE PLAN REVIEW: SP-12-17** Klajdi Ibi, 3170 Eleven Mile Road, North side of Eleven Mile Road, between Gardner and Griffith Avenues, Tax ID# 25-18-453-014 is requesting site plan approval for a building expansion.

The applicant, Klajdi Ibi, gave an overview of the project. He will expand the former Nip 'N' Tuck restaurant and rename it Golden Grille.

Commissioners then questioned the Mr. Ibi about the project and discussed the following topics:

- Size of the proposed expansion
- Installation of the awning
- The issues with cultured stone and winter maintenance
- The Engineering/Public Works review letter
- Location and size of dumpster & grease trap enclosure
- Handicap parking for sizing and location

The Commission invited to applicant to bring his architect to a future meetings to discuss the technical aspects of the site plan. Commissioners also suggested a vestibule for the building and the installation of bumper blocks to preserve the masonry wall along the parking areas. These were not made requirements of the site plan.

Chairperson Buckler opened the item up for public comment:

- Kurt Hite, Robina, noted a misprint on the plans that indicated a requirement for 33 parking spaces. It was confirmed that the site required 13 spaces.

**It was moved by Commissioner M. Smith and seconded by Commissioner Richardson to postpone SP-12-17 until the following items could be provided:**

- **Amend Site Plan to show enclosures for dumpster and grease trap**
- **Provide all items required by site plan review ordinance**
- **Indicate how the cultivated stone show in the plan is adhered to building**

**AYES:** Richardson, Murad, D. Smith, M. Smith, Shadle, Kapelanski, Tangari, and Buckler

**NAYS:** None

**Motion Carried.**

2. **DISCUSSION: PUD-01-17** Berkley-Coolidge, LLC, 2219 Coolidge Hwy, southwest corner of Coolidge and Oxford, Tax ID# 25-18-431-015, -016, -017 and a portion of -022, Lots 13-15 and 52-53 of the Denler Acres Subdivision is requesting Planned Unit Development approval for a mixed residential development.

Bennett Terebelo of Berkley-Coolidge, LLC noted the changes from their last presentation to this one those changes included updates to the following items:

- Landscaping and Public Plaza
- Lighting
- Aesthetics/Façade changes specific to EIFS and masonry
- Building/Site amenities

Chairperson Buckler opened the discussion up and allowed the audience to directly ask questions of the applicant:

- Jim Cox, Oxford, confirmed the removal of the existing school building and wanted a commitment from the developer that no large trucks would be using local streets during demolition and construction phases. He also questioned the provision of fire hydrants, water main, and appropriate firetruck turning radii throughout the proposal. Mr. Cox also asked about the storm sewer and its ability to “handle” the impact of this development during a large storm.
  - The applicant indicated he has been working with Public Works and Public Safety to make sure that the water, storm sewer, and the turning radii are all compliant with city and county standards.
- Mr. Cox also asked about on street parking and indicated that there are already too many cars on our local road system. Wanted to know how the project would prevent dangerous pedestrian/motorist interactions, especially in regards to children.
  - Applicant noted site aspects designed to keep intended to keep traffic directed toward Coolidge and away from local streets.
- Wendy Zabramski, noted the review from the Fire Marshall Pete Kelly who expressed concerns about turning radii and landscaping on the site.
- Kurt Hite, Robina, noted that the site plan is farther along than the previous site plan but is still too dense. He reiterated the fire safety concerns and added that the removal of the townhomes would reduce the need for a shared parking agreement with the church. Views into the parking lot could be improved with landscaping. He also noted that he was uncomfortable with the overall height as it was reminiscent of a six story building at its peak. Mr. Hite also called attention to the inclusion of fire pits even though they are not allowed by the City’s Code of Ordinances. He summarized his comments by noting that the removal of the townhouses would a step in the right direction.

The Chairperson requested that those speaking at the podium try to adhere to a three minute time limit so that everyone would have an opportunity to speak on this item.

- Patty Curtis, Kenmore, cited the master plan calls for “neighborhood retail” along the Coolidge Corridor and contrasted that with the purely residential project being proposed. She indicated that she would like to see a proposal that include a retail component on the ground floor. Ms. Curtis said the project is out of context and she considers the project irresponsible. She stated that she believed that townhomes are only included to offer a mix of housing types and shared concerns that they may not sell. She believes that the PUD is being pursued to sidestep zoning. She called the public plaza deceptive because of its size. Ms. Curtis also noted that the City has an opportunity to gain more benefits by entering into a contract through the PUD agreement. The City as the ability to draw hard lines as opposed to if/maybe statements on snow removal, pet waste, and how rainwater is addressed.
- Eric Wheeler, Oxford, noted his concerns with snow removal based upon the manner in which it is handled now. It is pushed up against his fence. His concern is that it will compromise his fence. He accused the applicant of “playing” the Planning Commission by adding a flag pole. He said there is smiley too much proposed for this site and traffic congestions issues are still a high concern. He summarized by saying this was a bad idea.
- Chuck Tyrell asked if a left turn was accounted for at Coolidge at Eleven Mile Road.
- Chris Riley shared his concern that back ups at Harvard will back up past the Oxford/Coolidge intersection. He shared that he feels the townhouses are ugly and should

be removed from the proposal. He also thinks the project is too big and will cause many problems with traffic and children in the street. He fears that a child could be hit by a car by someone from the apartments. He said local traffic all know about the kids but new residents may not know. He asked what recourse the City will have for these problem.

- Wendy Zabramski also asked what recourse the City will have for any problem caused by the project. She also noted that Village Green has poor reviews as a residential management company.
- Racheal Piacentini, Oxford, asked what recourse City would have for problems cause by project. Would residents have to sue the City?
- Kurt Hite, Robina, also asked about provisions for cleaning up pet waste. There are going to be a lot of people in this development and a high density of pets as well.
- Patty Curtis returned to the podium to discuss the pet waste as an issue which should not be minimized.
- Brandon Alger, lives in Meadowood Farms subdivision, he feels like good comments have been made so far and noted that the standards provided by ordinance are not being specifically addressed in the conversation thus far. He indicated that the townhomes are asymmetrical and visually stressful. He discussed stormwater standards provided by Oakland County. He characterized the standards as lax in contrast to Ann Arbor's standards.
- Jim Cannon, Harvard, stated that the townhomes should be removed in favor for green space or parking. Would like to see more height if the footprint could be downsized. He noted outstanding issues shared by his neighbors and asked specifically about how storm water standards are administered.
  - Eddie Zmich, representing the City's Engineering firm, discussed storm water management on the proposed development. He gave an overview of the Oakland County standards of being able to detain a "100 year storm event" which equates to 2 inches of rain in 2 hours and release it a .2 cubic feet per second (CFS) per acre which is an improvement over the existing condition. He also noted that there are best management practices (BMPs) that are being adopted by municipalities which would be useful on this site as well. Mr. Zmich again noted that he has not received any drawings which are required. He noted that 8 inch looped water main would be a requirement for the site, adequate fire hydrant coverage, and fire suppression lines reviewed by the Fire Marshall. The developer would be responsible for the installation of all infrastructure and then deeded to the City via a perpetual easement. Mr. Zmich then listed all the required permits required for a project such as this and the review process for each permit type.
  - Analise Pietras asked a question from the audience about the ultimate destination of a sewer water and confirmed that it all eventually flows into a single system.
  - Brandon Alger also asked a question from the audience clarifying the amount of rain per hour used to calculate a "100 year storm" and asked if a detention site can be designed to take off site storm flows.
- Lisa Kempner asked about the provision of sidewalks along "porkchop" traffic islands and along the Coolidge frontage.
- Barb Morris noted she shared the concerns of her neighbors and specifically stated her concerns with snow removal and the potential to lose parking spaces to snow piles.
- Karen Korber, Oxford, asked that the Planning Commission not minimize the concerns shared by those in attendance. Even if her immediate neighbors are not in attendance their concerns should be taken seriously.
- Analise Pietras, Franklin, shared concerns about the height of the building and felt it is too

tall and too close to Coolidge. She cited the Master Plan calls for complimentary developments to suburban design, indicated that the project is too dense adding 43 residents per acre, it would be better to remove a floor from the project. She felt that the street elevations and new curb cuts are a detriment to walkability which as also an emphasis of the Master Plan. She noted that this project needs to be guided by a planner which the City has not had since June.

**This being a discussion item, there was no required action from the Planning Commission.**

\* \* \* \* \*

**3. PLANNED UNIT DEVELOPMENT:** PUD-01-17 Berkley-Coolidge. LLC, 2219 Coolidge Hwy, southwest corner of Coolidge and Oxford, Tax ID# 25-18-431-015, -016, -017 and a portion of -022, Lots 13-15 and 52-53 of the Denler Acres Subdivision is requesting Planned Unit Development approval for a mixed residential development.

Following the resident discussion the Planning Commissioners discussed the Planned Unit Development proposal.

- Commissioner D. Smith suggested that the City could join with the developer to upsize the storm water detention system to provide greater community development. He wanted to see the accommodations be made for current and future firetrucks. He expressed support for the townhouses as a transition to the single family residential homes along Oxford. He also feels as though the use compliments the intent of the Master Plan based upon his recollection as of the drafters of the 2007 document.
- Commissioner Tangari noted that the issues of snow and pet waste removal are valid and should be addressed in PUD agreement. He questioned the lighting of the in the pedestrian park as it was shown as dark on the photometric study. Tangari addressed concerns with the townhouse. He does not like the look of the continuous roof line as it makes the buildings appear too large for the street and he prefers a hip roof. He also asked for the number of shared spaces to be called out separate from the dedicated ones for both the church and the proposed development. He indicated that the size of the building was large but that concerned is mitigated slightly by the distance from the neighborhood.
- Commissioner Shadle noted that this is an evolving process and that the feedback offered is important. She specifically wanted to see the Fire Marshall's comments addressed.
- Commissioner Murad reiterated that balconies should be tied to brick and not EIFS. He discussed the Washtenaw County standards and asked that the City engineer provide that to the commission in the future. He also said he liked the wire grids on the first level that allows ivy to grow. He noted that he wanted to see the following items:
  - Elevations on the plans
  - Wants to see scale from Oxford
  - Shadow Study
  - 3D modeling on the townhouses showing 8 foot porches
  - Address snow removal and pet waste
- Commissioner Kapelanski noted that the site plan needs additional details and would also like to see 3D modeling of the townhouses. She would also like to see some of the storm water best practices included in the plans. She noted that there was too much EIFS on rear west elevation, and asked that it mirror the front east elevation in EIFS to masonry ratio.

- Commissioner Richardson noted that the plan has come along way since initial site plan. He noted disappointment that the green roof has been removed from the plan because of the expense. He would have liked to see the figures on the green roof and how much was saved by its removal. He is supportive of the townhouses but would like to see some distinctiveness in their design. He also likes the public park but it seems too isolated and needs to be more inviting. He said he understands the need for the circular drive on Coolidge and sees the need for parking declining over the next several years and would like to see areas dedicated to parking returned to green space.
- Commissioner M. Smith restated the need for the applicant to provide preliminary civil engineering as part of the site plan requirements. The site plan should also address the fire truck turning radii and snow removal. He agreed that pet waste should be addressed by the applicant. He asked about transformers or generators on site and, if they are to be installed, then the possible locations should be indicated. He asked about alternative dumpster locations because of the proximity to the public plaza. He would also like to see a 3D rendering of the townhomes. He stated that he is satisfied with the EIFS to masonry ratio. He also wanted to see building dimensions and a confirmation of square footages for each apartment types. He is satisfied with the landscaping included in the plan.
- Chairperson Buckler indicated she was disappointed that the green roof was removed in latest plan. The 3D model should include the Harvard Commons and the townhouses should be altered to remove the continuous roof. She feels that the use does compliment the Master Plan which did not envision Coolidge as a continuous retail strip. She feels that storm water will adequately addressed by existing standards based upon the city engineer's comments. She is also satisfied with the parking provided and believes that reliance on vehicles over time will reduce the need for the spaces. She stated that overall she thinks this could be a good development.

Commissioners discussed the stripping on the shared parking lot to better accommodate the flow of traffic from the project parking areas to Harvard Road. The provision of parking was also discussed and how reductions in reliance on vehicles could be addressed. The inclusion of solar panels was also discussed for the roof and the covered parking areas.

Chair Buckler noted that the comments from this meeting would be summarized to the applicant and that the Public Hearing was the next step in this process. Commissioner discussed the holding the public hearing on January 9, 2018.

### **LIAISON REPORTS**

Tim Murad reported that the Chamber of Commerce has explore Berkley gift certificates are available for the holiday season.

Mark Richardson offered a report from the Environmental Advisory Board's recent efforts on their Sustainability Plan.

Joe Tangari reported that the Downtown Development Authority was working hard to develop a wayfinding signage strategy and design guidelines.

Dean Smith reported on the Zoning Board of Appeals heard and denied a case at their last meeting. He urged everyone to make sure permits are pulled when they are doing projects.

Marty Smith gave an overview of the recent City Council regular meeting and the meeting at the library to discuss the sewer system improvements at the home plumbing system.

\* \* \* \* \*

**STAFF/COMMISSIONER COMMENTS**

The commissioners all joined together to thank those who attended and made comments and to wish everyone a happy holiday season.

\* \* \* \* \*

**There being no further business, Chairperson Buckler called for a motion to adjourn the meeting. It was moved by Commissioner Murad and supported by Commissioner Richardson to adjourn the December 12, 2017 regular meeting of the Berkley Planning Commission.**

**AYES: Richardson, Buckler, Murad, Shadle, Dean Smith, Martin Smith, Barnett  
NAYS: None**

**Motion Carried and the meeting adjourned at 11:21 PM.**