

ABSENT: Buckler
Motion Carried.

* * * * *

COMMUNICATIONS

Ms. Vansen brought to the Planning Commission’s attention agendas from two Downtown Development Authority meetings.

* * * * *

CITIZEN COMMENTS

None.

* * * * *

1. **ELECTIONS:** Matter of electing a chairperson, vice chairperson, and secretary of the Planning Commission

Commissioner Murad asked for clarification regarding the duties of the chairperson. Ms. Vansen advised that along with chairing the meeting, the chair is available to confer with the Planner on setting the agenda. The Planning Commission’s practice has been to have the chairperson attend the City Council meetings as well.

It was established that current Chairperson Barnett, Vice Chairperson Martin Smith, and Secretary Richardson were willing to serve another term.

It was established that no other commissioners were interested in serving.

The following people spoke during the public comment portion of this item:

Paul Shkreli, 2059 Royal

It was moved by Commissioner Dean Smith to nominate David Barnett as Chairperson, Martin Smith as Vice-Chairperson, and Mark Richardson as Secretary.

Supported by Commissioner Popp.

AYES: Richardson, Popp, Murad Dean Smith, Shadle, Tangari, Martin Smith, Barnett

NAYS: None

ABSENT: Buckler

Motion Carried.

* * * * *

2. **APPOINTMENTS:** Matter of appointing Planning Commission liaisons to the Downtown Development Authority (meets the second Wednesday of every month at 8 AM), the City Council (meets the first and third Monday of every month at 7 PM), and the Chamber of Commerce (meets the second Wednesday of every month at 5:15 PM).

Commissioner Popp will serve as Downtown Development Authority liaison.
Commissioner Murad will serve as the Chamber liaison.
Commissioner Richardson will serve as the Environmental Committee liaison.
Chairperson Barnett will serve as the City Council liaison.

Chairperson Barnett advised that he had been approached by the Parks and Recreation Advisory Board to have a planning commissioner attend that meeting. Ms. Vansen will determine when the Board meets and report back to the Planning Commission.

Chairperson Barnett pointed out that Commissioners Tangari and Buckler are serving on a Coolidge Ad Hoc Committee.

* * * * *

3. **REZONING: RZ-02-16** 27799 Woodward LLC, regarding 960, 972, 984 Oxford and the east 20 feet of 996 Oxford, Lots 306, 307, and 308, and the east 20 feet of Lot 305 of the Larkmoor Boulevard Subdivision, Parcel ID's: 25-17-431-023, 25-17-431-022, 25-17-431-021, and 20 easterly feet of 25-17-431-034, north side of Oxford, between Woodward and Stanford, is requesting a rezoning from Single Family Residential District (R-1D) to Parking District (P-1). In accordance with Section 138-681 (a), a sketch plan of the proposed parking lot will also be discussed.

Tom Kalas and KC Crain were present representing the applicant. Mr. Kalas reviewed the submitted information including a site plan and renderings of the proposed parking lot. A new home at 996 Oxford is also being proposed. He advised that a site plan and engineering approvals are still required after the rezoning is approved.

Ms. Vansen explained that a conditional rezoning protects cities from a developer saying he is going to develop one thing and then after the rezoning goes through developing something entirely different albeit legal. Ms. Vansen advised that the commission should let the applicant know any concerns or comments relative to the parking lot (driveways, landscaping, the screenwall, lighting). Those specifics should be settled before the site plan comes back to the Planning Commission.

Chairperson Barnett expressed concern that the proposed Eaton parking lot was not being presented. The rest of the commission echoed this concern.

Mr. Kalas replied that the Eaton property will not afford enough parking for the restaurant. The restaurant is currently leasing parking from the Donut Cutter and Northpointe Medical Center. They would like to terminate those leases. He emphasized that the Eaton parking lot would be built at the same time as the Oxford parking lot.

Mr. Kalas estimated that the Eaton property development will yield an additional 14 parking spaces. There are currently 15 at 1010 Eaton and 26 parking spaces on the restaurant's site.

Commissioner Murad reviewed that Vinsetta Garage is required to have 64 parking spaces. The additional parking needed elsewhere equals 9 parking spaces.

The Commission clarified that the leased spaces are only usable when the primary businesses are closed—after 5 PM and on Saturdays and Sundays for Northpointe and after 5 PM for Donut Cutter.

Commissioner Popp lives next to Northpointe Medical Center and advised the Commission that cars are not parked at Northpointe.

Mr. Kalas advised that leased parking is a problem and that Vinsetta very much wants its own parking lot. The parking demands since the restaurant opened remain unchanged.

In considering the site plan, Commissioner Martin Smith confirmed that a conditional rezoning was similar to a Planned Unit Development.

Chairperson Barnett opened the public hearing at 8:09 PM.

Tara Hayes, 1021 Oxford, stated she was speaking on behalf of the following people listed in the submitted petition: Catherine Guirey, Patricia and John DuLong, Georgea Kovanis, Elyse Ciaravino, Jordan Zuk, Adam Simpson, MacKenzie Austgen, Tony Beswick, Jason Sherman, Nicole and Joel Woznicki, Marie Baranda, Nichole Sanan, Diane Cicchini, Robert Robinette, Tara Hayes, Jessica and Karl Gustafson, Melissa Sherman, Lisa Wenzler, Shawn Breen, John Ursu, Matt and Leslie Mio, Josh Sanom. These residents oppose the proposed rezoning. In 2014 a rezoning application was opposed by the residents. The reasons remain. There is enough parking in this neighborhood. The City has accommodated the business owner by rezoning three residential lots to parking. The City's master plan opposes the rezoning of Oxford to parking. The petitioner has failed to fulfill his promises many times. The Eaton property can now be redeveloped into parking but no site plan has been submitted. There continues to be a 'No Parking' sign at the 1010 Eaton parking lot. Valet parking should provide any necessary overflow parking, yet the parking lot at Northpointe Medical Center goes unused. The owners of Vinsetta Garage share parking at their other locations: Fenton Firehouse and Union Joints both use parking lots owned by others. The popularity of the Vinsetta Garage has declined and on-street parking on Eaton and Oxford is available even during peak times. The petitioner has not kept his word repeatedly. The parking problem is being manufactured. The "empty home" policy on Oxford is detrimental to the neighborhood. Allowing a parking lot of this size would permit the restaurant to expand. Berkley is within the top 20 realty markets in the country. A walkable community is an asset. There are parking lots available for the petitioner to use. She advocated for more cooperation, less concrete. She closed by saying a want is still not a need.

Lori Robetson of 1964 Dorothea, Rachel Piacentini of 1726 Oxford, Barbara Morris of 1714 Wiltshire and Patricia Curtis of 2847 Kenmore questioned how a business could open without the correct amount of parking, whether Vinsetta Garage required a rezoning to change from a car repair shop to a restaurant, when the Planning Commission reviews items, did they review Vinsetta in accordance with the law, and how Ms. Vansen approved this business. The Planning Commission and Ms. Vansen explained zoning laws and how businesses are reviewed and approved.

Jon Long, 2060 Kipling observed that Northpointe Medical Center has a large parking lot that could be utilized after 5 PM.

Lewis Bishop, 1404 Eaton, observed that Donut Cutter is used while Northpointe has been sitting empty.

Hearing no further comments, Chairperson Barnett closed the public hearing at 8:35 PM.

Commissioner Martin Smith stated he was surprised to see the Oxford rezoning. Commissioners Murad and Richardson stated that Eaton should be developed first and then Oxford could be evaluated or a small number of parking spaces could be leased from a neighboring business. Commissioner Tangari opined that the renderings were generic and did not take into consideration the surrounding buildings.

It was moved by Commissioner Martin Smith to recommend denial of RZ-02-16 to the City Council.

Supported by Commissioner Murad.

AYES: Richardson, Popp, Murad Dean Smith, Shadle, Tangari, Martin Smith, Barnett

NAYS: None

ABSENT: Buckler

Motion Carried.

* * * * *

4. **DISCUSSION:** Discussion to amend the 2015 Master Plan amendment related to future residential land use to include:
 - a. Discussion/recap of the open house held on August 23, 2016.
 - b. Determination of next steps.

Chairperson Barnett began by thanking those residents and property owners that attended the August open house. The Commission received a lot of letters and articles. He advised that the Commission would be seeking additional input including meeting with senior citizens, high school students, and Beaumont Hospital. He thought that the Target Market Housing Needs Assessment mentioned in Ms. Vansen's report was also a good idea. He continued that he thought that a meeting Public Works would also be prudent to discuss our aging infrastructure.

The rest of the commissioners echoed these sentiments and thanked the residents that have spent many hours collecting additional comments. The commission heard that communication was a big concern of those attending the open house.

Commissioner Dean Smith stated that he heard residents wanted higher density residential confined to major thoroughfares while the interior remained mostly single family. However, affordable housing is an issue and he wanted the commission and residents to talk through possibilities such as duplexes. He thought holding more open houses would be a good idea.

Commissioner Richardson echoed these sentiments and offered that he had taken the time to review master plans for Royal Oak, Pleasant Ridge, and Ferndale. All of those communities say alternative housing should be developed.

Commissioner Murad mentioned that he will probably be looking to downsize to a single level, low maintenance residence in his next move. At this point he will have to move out of the city and he opined that this shouldn't be the case.

There was discussion about changing setback requirements and/or height allowances on residential lots.

The following people spoke during the public comment portion of this item:

Lori Robertson, 1964 Dorothea
Rob Robinette, 1021 Oxford
Paul Shkreli, 2059 Royal
Joshua Hunter, 2240 Thomas
Lisa Kempner-Allen, 2260 Columbia

Barbara Morris, 1714 Wiltshire
Kurt Hite, 3525 Robina
Kaylyn Milan, 2359 Bacon
Rachel Piacentini, 1726 Oxford
Patty Curtis, 2847 Kenmore

* * * * *

CITIZEN COMMENTS

The following people spoke during Citizens Comments:

Tara Hayes, 1021 Oxford

* * * * *

LIAISON REPORTS

Commissioner Popp reported from the Downtown Development Authority that Robina has been closed for a 2 month trial. The DDA has 3 vacancies. The DDA is seeking a DDA manager.

Commissioner Murad reported that the Chamber is up to 150 members. The IrishFest had 3-5000 attendees. The fairy door project is being continued with the doors being decorated for the holidays.

Commissioner Richardson did not have a report from the Environmental Advisory Committee.

Chairperson Barnett reported that the City Council hosted a presentation by the Regional Transit Authority.

Commissioner Dean Smith stated that at the last ZBA meeting considered a carport being turned into a garage. The case was denied.

* * * * *

STAFF/COMMISSIONER COMMENTS

Commissioner Martin Smith advised he was planning on attending the Huntington Woods meeting on Aging in Place.

Commissioner Dean Smith stated that setback requirements have not changed, but houses have gotten taller. He thought a work session would be a good idea to set up a work plan for the master plan amendment.

* * * * *

There being no further business, Chairperson Barnett adjourned the meeting at 10:36 PM.